

HISTORIC AREA COMMISSION
New Castle Town Hall
2nd and Delaware Streets
April 19, 2012

Present: Sally Monigle, Chairperson
Dorsey Fiske*
Doug Heckrotte
Bill Hentkowski
Tom McDowell

Also Present: Debby Pullan, Building Department

*joined meeting at 5:20 p.m.

Ms. Monigle called the meeting to order at 5:15 p.m. Roll call followed.

OLD APPLICATIONS

J. Day, 100 West 3rd Street

Approval for Historic Area Commission Certificate of Compliance

Discussion: A representative of the contractor presented. All outstanding concerns have been addressed to HAC's satisfaction. *(Mr. McDowell stated he believes it was an injustice to require the applicant to lower the roof and incur the additional expense.)*

Action: Mr. Heckrotte moved to vote on the application for 100 West 3rd Street to receive a Historic Area Commission Certificate of Compliance . Mr. McDowell seconded the motion.

Disposition: The motion was approved.

L. Ratchford, 24 The Strand

Modification of previous application that was approved (March 2012).

Discussion: The recommendation was that the applicant research a different roof for the second floor. She presented a factory-made, standing seam metal roof that will fit in nicely with the area. It is considered a "cool" roof.

Action: Mr. Heckrotte made a motion to vote on the application as submitted. Ms. Fiske seconded the motion.

Disposition: The motion was approved.

L. Fontana, 46 East 4th Street

Approval for Historic Area Commission Certificate of Compliance

Discussion: Mr. McDowell thanked the applicants (L. Fontana and S. Zorrer) for complying with replacing all 21 windows, rather than the 17 windows as ordered in a recent Board of Adjustment ruling. He complimented them on donating the former windows to Habitat for Humanity.

Action: Mr. McDowell made a motion to approve 46 East 4th Street to receive their Historic Area Commission Certificate of Compliance. Mr. Hentkowski seconded the motion.

Disposition: The motion was approved.

N. Jodlbauer, 53 East 4th Street

Revised plans for renovation of old barn building. (Came to HAC 8/2/11.) Discussion: Mr. McDowell believes that putting new pine board on with the old board will not look good and that the two sides and

front should be stained a uniform color. The barn was built in the 1800s. The owner is not present, nor is there a representative for the owner present to address concerns. (*Discussion.*)

Action: Mr. McDowell made a motion to table this matter until next meeting and request Ms. Jodlbauer to attend and address questions and concerns. Mr. Hentkowski seconded the motion. **Disposition:** Roll call vote called. Mr. Heckrotte voted in favor of tabling recognizing there have been problems with the applicant in the past. Mr. McDowell voted in favor of the motion. Mr. Hentkowski voted in favor of the motion. Ms. Fiske voted against the motion stating Mr. Lapp (contractor) is credible. Ms. Monigle voted against the motion for the same reasons stated by Ms. Fiske. The motion carried by a vote of 3-2.

K. Wipf, 221 Harmony Street

A/C condenser unit placement approval.

Discussion: Ms. Wipf presented a drawing showing placement of the A/C unit. The unit will be placed on her property against the fence in the alleyway. It is not visible from the street and will not protrude into the alley. She stated her neighbor has no objection with the placement of the A/C unit.

Action: Mr. Heckrotte made a motion to vote on the application as submitted. Ms. Fiske seconded the motion.

Disposition: The motion was approved.

NEW APPLICATIONS

L. Deemer, 207 Harmony Street

Replace front door.

Discussion: Tommy Little, attorney, (neighbor) and Mark Brown, contractor, presented. Pictures of the previous door on 207 Harmony Street and the door that replaced the previous door were circulated. Mr. Brown presented a map of the historic district of the City of New Castle and stated there are 168 storm doors in the district, not including 207 Harmony Street. Mr. McDowell questioned how many of the 168 storm doors are wood doors, which is the required door. Mr. Brown responded there is a mix of doors. They did not come before HAC to ask for approval to install the current door because it was an emergency. They said they did not know they were required to come before HAC for emergencies. The door that was replaced was actually an interior door that had been modified to act as the exterior door. The cost of the replacement door was estimated to be \$1,700. The interior door that was installed is a solid oak door and the storm door is an Anderson metal door, full view. Representatives for the owner acknowledge a mistake was made.

Action: Mr. McDowell made a motion that the aluminum storm door be replaced with a wood, full glass door to be in compliance with the litany of the HAC. Mr. Heckrotte seconded the motion.

Disposition: The motion was approved.

Ms. Monigle informed Mr. Little they have the right to appeal the decision of HAC to the Board of Adjustment.

Mr. Heckrotte questioned the six-panel oak door that was installed does not meet HAC guidelines. Mr. McDowell does not object to this door. Mr. Heckrotte said HAC does try to put four-panel doors and six-panel doors where they belong.

Action: Mr. Heckrotte made a motion that HAC require that the prime door be replaced with a four-panel door appropriate for the house (as seen in the photograph of the original door). Ms. Fiske seconded the motion.

Disposition: The motion was approved by a vote of 4-1 (McDowell).

Ms. Monigle informed Mr. Little of their right to appeal the decisions of HAC to the Board of Adjustment.

G. Rill, 60 West 4th Street

Replace fence.

Discussion: The fence will be the same height as the neighbor's fence.

Action: Mr. Heckrotte made a motion to vote on the application as submitted. Ms. Fiske seconded the motion.

Disposition: The motion was approved.

K. Tidball, 44 West 4th Street

Replace existing concrete steps with brick steps.

T. Geraghty, 46 West 4th Street

Replace existing brick steps.

Action: Mr. Heckrotte made a motion to vote on the application of 44 and 46 West 4th Street as submitted for replacement brick steps to be built as one unit which will have additional tread, wider landing (because of Code), brick will be laid flat, no side walls, iron railings on both sides comparable to what currently exists (none in middle). Mr. McDowell seconded the motion.

Disposition: The motion was approved.

P. Guttenplan, 167 E. 2nd Street

Replace air conditioning outdoor unit.

Discussion: This unit is not visible.

Action: Mr. Heckrotte made a motion to vote on the application as submitted. Ms. Fiske seconded the motion.

Disposition: The motion was approved.

407 Williams Street

Replace existing brick moulding. Repair/replace jamb, trim on windows and doors as needed. Repair stucco as needed.

Action: Mr. Heckrotte made a motion to vote on the application as submitted. Ms. Fiske seconded the motion.

Disposition: The motion was approved.

R. Poskitt, 17 The Strand

Remove and replace existing brick sidewalk.

Action: Mr. Heckrotte made a motion to vote on the application as submitted. Mr. Hentkowski seconded the motion.

Disposition: The motion was approved.

New Castle Presbyterian Church, 25 East 2nd Street

Outdoor condensing unit replacement.

Action: Mr. Heckrotte made a motion to vote on the application as submitted. Mr. Hentkowski seconded the motion.

Disposition: The motion was approved.

J. Plant, 75 West 5th Street

Building deck off back of house.

Discussion: It was noted that HAC typically does not approve decks in the historic district; however, Ms. Pullan said the deck will be even with the neighbor's deck, which is close to the ground. The material will be wood. No pictures or drawings were presented.

Action: Mr. McDowell made a motion to continue this application until HAC receives a drawing and more details (design, location, material to be used, hand-sketched plot plan). Mr. Heckrotte seconded the motion.

Disposition: The motion was approved.

EMERGENCY REPAIRS

S. Morris, 110 West 3rd Street

Remove 3 square of shingles on front porch and replace with 2 square torch down flat roof membrane per specs attached. LEAKING.

Discussion: Mr. Morris said the existing shingles are architectural and have a slate color. The porch roof is barely visible from the street. Mr. Hentkowski suggested whatever roof is visible the shingles should match.

Action: Mr. Heckrotte moved to vote on the application as submitted with the requirement that the shingles match the requirement of the litany which is weathered wood blend and a member of HAC will look at it. Mr. McDowell seconded the motion.

Disposition: The motion was approved.

J. Geisel, 22 West 3rd Street

Replace front door and replace back sliding door with French doors per specs attached.

Discussion: The applicant informed of a small amendment to the application to delete the mail slot in the front door. They will put up a mail box instead. The replacement front door will be six panel and the metal storm door will be removed and HAC asked that a wood storm door be replaced.

Action: Mr. Heckrotte made a motion to vote on the application as submitted with the proviso the new storm door be wood in accordance with the litany. Ms. Fiske seconded the motion.

Disposition: The motion was approved.

New Business

Litany – There was discussion about the editing of the litany, how it was stated and the fact that no input from HAC was requested. Ms. Monigle wants to review requiring wood storm doors and be more specific with the design of those doors. Mr. Heckrotte expressed his opinion that the current litany continue to be used by HAC. That document that states wood materials are to be used.

Approval of Minutes – A motion was made and seconded to approve the minutes of the March 2012 meeting as distributed. The motion was approved.

Adjournment -- There being no further business to address, the meeting was adjourned at 6:30 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Debbie Turner

Debbie Turner
Stenographer